



**XUNTA DE GALICIA**  
CONSELLERÍA DE FACENDA  
Dirección Xeral de Planificación  
e Orzamentos



Fondo Social Europeo  
O FSE inviste no teu futuro

galicia

Executive summary of the evaluation of the objectives and results of the priorities OP FSE Galicia 2014-2020 for the annual report to be submitted in 2017

**June 2017**

*Elaboration: Subdirección Xeral de Planificación*

## 1. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

According to the Specific Evaluation Plan of the ESF Galicia 2014-2020 Operational Programme (OP), the **evaluation of the objectives and results of the OP for the 2017 annual report** has been carried out, in accordance with the Guidance document on Evaluation provided by the Managing Authority. This evaluation has been carried out by internal evaluators, functionally independent of the authorities responsible for implementing the OP.

This evaluation analyzes the implementation of the OP, examining the financial efficiency, effectiveness and efficiency of the output indicators, measuring results obtained and expected values at out for **selected operations as of December 31, 2016**. On the other hand, information related to **completed operations** (fully implemented and likely to produce immediate effects) that were financially significant at that date, has been analyzed.

This evaluation is conditioned both on the object of analysis (selected operations and completed operations) and on the methodology (implementation evaluation and theory-based evaluation), due to the short period of time for implementing co-financed actions, **given time delays in both the Programme's approval and procedures implementation**.

Based on these restrictions, the analysis has been structured in order to provide an effective response to a battery of **evaluation questions** that present an in-depth examination of the overall situation and evolution of the Programme, beyond the minimum requirements of the Specific Evaluation Plan.

### Evolution and pertinence of the intervention logic:

The evaluation **does not notice significant changes in external coherence** in this initial implementation of the ESF Galicia 2014-2020 Operational Programme. The programme is fully integrated into the strategic programming of the Autonomous Community of Galicia, with its maximum exponent being the "Strategic Plan of Galicia 2015-2020", which ensures consistency with the other Programmes and Plans in force in the region, together with an effective use of economies of scale.

Overall, regional progress in the areas in which the programme operates show signs of recovery after recent years of crisis, which translates into a **slight improvement in some of the weaknesses justifying the OP strategy**. Even though this improvement has not been enough to correct the weaknesses and close the gaps with respect to European average data or to other Spanish regions, it can be concluded that the **intervention logic and the needs detected did not vary substantially** since the programming stage of the OP.

### Evolution of the Programme

There have been **120 operations and aid schemes** authorised, totalling €117,130,119 in terms of financial support, **37.4% of total ESF support programmed in the OP**. These operations correspond to 30 of the 33 action lines programmed. With respect to the financial theoretical trail for years 2015 and 2016, the selected operations cover 98.6%. On the other hand, operations completed at 12/31/2016 amount to 34,594,378 euro in terms of support, while **implemented and verified support amounts to 7,134,655 euro**, representing a total of 29.5% and 6.1% of the selected operations, respectively. In this regard, it is appropriate to approach this **analysis of selected operations with caution**, awaiting further progress in the implementation of the programme.

## Analysis of selected operations

- The financial allocation of selected operations fulfills and reinforces the **dual thematic concentration**: on the one hand, 87.8% of support is concentrated in the 5 most important investment priorities financially, exceeding the programmed percentage. In addition, Axis 2 operations "Promoting social inclusion, combating poverty and any discrimination" account for 27.2% of total support selected (without Technical Assistance), in line with the percentage established in programming documents.
- Operations selected show, in line with what has been programmed, a direct link with the objectives of the **Europe 2020 strategy** on education, employment and the fight against poverty and social exclusion.
- **Operations selected are consistent with the strategy defined in the OP** and therefore with the structure of the OP (priority axes, investment priorities and specific objectives) and with the lines of action initially programmed.
- Selected operations have been characterized by their breadth and depth from the perspective of **beneficiaries**. Among the groups with the highest relative presence are people with primary education (ISCED 1) or secondary (ISCED 2), the unemployed, including the long-term unemployed and people experiencing or at risk of social exclusion and women belonging to most vulnerable groups.
- With regard to **financial effectiveness**, the approval of the ESF Galicia 2014-2020 OP in December 2015 delayed the start of the program, conditioning the results of the programme in its first effective year: 2016. The effectiveness review of selected operations concludes that the **current degree of effectiveness is high** in the overall OP, especially in Axes 1B "Promoting sustainable and quality employment and supporting labour mobility" and 2B "Promoting social inclusion, combating poverty and any discrimination".
- The **effectiveness analysis of output indicators** by investment priority (IP), which measures the degree of progress towards the target value in 2023, indicates that of the 17 indicators studied, 13 have a high degree of efficiency, 2 a medium degree and 2 a low degree.
- The analysis of the **efficiency of output indicators** by IP, comparing the unit cost as programmed with the unit cost obtained from selected operations, indicates that of the 17 indicators studied, 4 have a high degree of efficiency, 9 a medium degree and 4 a low degree.
- As regards the **performance framework**, operations selected as at 31/12/2016 exceed in all the Thematic Objectives what was established as a milestone of the financial indicator. The analysis of output indicators of the performance framework shows a **high degree of effectiveness** in the OP and in Thematic Objectives 8, 9 and 10.
- With regard to the analysis of the **effectiveness of result indicators**, out of the 22 indicators studied, 14 have a high level of efficiency, 3 of them present an average level, in another 3, effectiveness is less than 50%. Finally, for two indicators there is no information to assess the degree of effectiveness.
- If the analysis is undertaken with **success rates** of the 20 result indicators, out of the 18 indicators with information, 94.4% have a high degree of effectiveness and in the remaining 5.6% the grade is average. In none of the indicators the observed rate is below 50% of the expected rate.

### Analysis of completed operations:

- The approval of the ESF Galicia OP 2014-2020 in December 2015 delayed the start of the programme, so **financial efficiency** of completed operations is **low**.
- According to **output indicators** of completed operations, the number of participants was 15,249, of which 41.6% are women. The degree of **effectiveness** of these indicators is high in 1 of them, medium in 4 and low in 5. The degree of **efficiency** is high in 6 indicators, average in 2 and low in 2, in line with information on performance attached to selected operations.
- As regards the **performance framework**, the effectiveness of output indicators shows a high performance in Thematic Objectives 08 and 10 and an average in 09.
- The information related to **result indicators** of these operations presents a **low coverage rate** that prevents an analysis of their efficiency.

### Evaluation of implementation

The implementation of the ESF Galicia 2014-2020 OP in the early years of the programming period (2015-2016) is clearly conditioned by the **difficulties encountered in the implementation of the OP and which have resulted in the accumulation of a series of time delays** such as: the delay in the approval of the Programme and the necessary adaptation that requires managing new action lines; the transfer of the joint delay resulting from the late approval to the rest of the procedures related to management and implementation; delays in the formal designation of Managing Authority and in the selection of Intermediate Bodies; and delays in defining national eligibility rules.

However, during this initial phase of the start-up of the OP, significant progress has been made in the definition and implementation of the systems that guarantee an effective implementation of the OP strategy, as well as in the operations selection phase.

During the period of analysis, 2015-2016, relevant powers for the OP authorities have been put in place, mainly related to programming, definition and elaboration of management and control systems and procedures, selection of operations and, management of the OP was partially implemented.

Regarding the Intermediate Body, after its designation, the definition and description of systems and procedures followed, which constitute a reference that guarantees the efficiency in the development of the selected operations. Nevertheless, it presents, among its weaknesses, some degree of delay in its approval, that has generated some uncertainty and time delays in the implementation of operations.

The defined systems and procedures have been properly developed and publicised in the framework of the Manual of Procedures for Management and Control of the ESF Galicia 2014-2020 OP.

In general terms, the Programme's governance, management and communication are considered adequate despite the conditioning caused by delays in the implementation of the Programme.

### Incorporation of horizontal principles

The **principle of gender equality and non-discrimination** is being applied both in the preparation of the OP and in the management, monitoring and evaluation of the ESF Galicia 2014-2020 OP.

It has involved both the competent authorities in this issue (Secretary General of Equality), as well as the authorities of the OP, but also public beneficiaries and management bodies.

It has been implemented through procedures for selection of operations, management, monitoring and, even if it is early to reach a definitive conclusion, also foreseeable in information and communication procedures.

In the management of the programme, this principle is being applied with a comprehensive perspective: with an application of mainstreaming (gender mainstreaming) and with the development of concrete actions aimed at promoting such equality.

Direct actions in favour of **equality between women and men** are framed both in the field of employment (thematic objective 8), with direct support for the promotion of women's entrepreneurship, as well as support for work-life balance and to companies for implementing equality plans, and in the area of poverty reduction and social inclusion (thematic objective 9), with actions aimed at vulnerable women in order to facilitate their incorporation into the labour market, such as counselling and support through the Women Information Centres (CIMs), along with actions to support women victims of gender-based violence and human trafficking for sexual purposes.

## Recommendations

The **recommendations** of this evaluation exercise are the following:

- **Streamline the tasks of execution and verification** of the selected operations to ensure the implementation of the programmed execution path in terms of certification, and maximize the use of the ESF assistance thanks to compliance with both the N + 3 rule and the performance framework, in accordance with the procedures already approved in the Manual of Procedures for Management and Control of the OP.
- Carry out a **detailed monitoring and analysis of output indicators** once the expected pace of certification is reached in the next few years, in order to analyze those in which difficulties are detected in reaching the 2023 targets or considerable levels of over-execution.
- Improve the **indicators' collection system** and the questionnaires from which they are obtained, to ensure the completeness and consistency of data.
- **Increase coordination** with the Managing Authority and the managing bodies of the OP to accelerate and ensure an adequate implementation rate of the OP to meet set objectives.
- **Carry out effective monitoring** of the implementation of investments of the multi-regional ESF POs in Galicia and other European and regional programmes co-financed with European support, in order to increase co-ordination between administrations and complementarity between Community actions.
- In the framework of **Investment Priority 8.5, there is a need to complete the selection of operations** since, otherwise, the accumulated delay may lead to questioning fulfilment of the objectives envisaged, even though performance framework milestones are not being challenged.